

RESOURCE GUIDE

Serving Youth Remotely

Strategies for Practitioners

Amanda Briggs

Shayne Spaulding

Natalie Spievack

Ayesha Islam

Theresa Anderson March 2021





ABOUT THE URBAN INSTITUTE

The nonprofit Urban Institute is a leading research organization dedicated to developing evidence-based insights that improve people's lives and strengthen communities. For 50 years, Urban has been the trusted source for rigorous analysis of complex social and economic issues; strategic advice to policymakers, philanthropists, and practitioners; and new, promising ideas that expand opportunities for all. Our work inspires effective decisions that advance fairness and enhance the well-being of people and places.

Copyright © March 2021. Urban Institute. Permission is granted for reproduction of this file, with attribution to the Urban Institute. Cover image by Look Studio/Shutterstock.

Contents

Acknowledgments	iv
Introduction	1
Prioritizing Equity in Remote Service Delivery	2
Create the Foundation for Success	4
Key Issues and Challenges	4
Promising Practices and Tips	5
Strengthen Organizational and Staff Capacity to Meet New Demands	8
Key Issues and Challenges	8
Promising Practices and Tips	9
Provide Services That Support Mental and Emotional Health	11
Key Issues and Challenges	11
Promising Practices and Tips	12
Build Community	13
Key Issues and Challenges	14
Promising Practices and Tips	14
Ensure That Instruction Is Engaging	16
Key Issues and Challenges	16
Promising Practices and Tips	17
Adapt Experiential and Work-Based Learning to the Virtual Environment	20
Key Issues and Challenges	20
Promising Practices and Tips	21
Implications for Organizations, Funders, and Policymakers	22
Appendix A: Interviewees	25
Appendix B: Characteristics of Organizations Interviewed	26
Notes	29
References	31
About the Authors	33
Statement of Independence	35

Acknowledgments

This report was funded by the Annie E. Casey Foundation. We are grateful to them and to all our funders, who make it possible for Urban to advance its mission.

The views expressed are those of the authors and should not be attributed to the Annie E. Casey Foundation or to the Urban Institute, its trustees, or its funders. Funders do not determine research findings or the insights and recommendations of Urban experts. Further information on the Urban Institute's funding principles is available at urban.org/funding principles.

We want to extend our sincere thanks to the many workforce, education, and employment practitioners and experts who lent their expertise, reviewed this document, and helped it reach the right stakeholders. Finally, we greatly appreciate the time shared by each individual who was interviewed for this project (listed in appendix A). Their insights formed the foundation of this work.

V ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Introduction

Programs that serve youth ages 16 to 24 can play a critical role in improving education and employment outcomes, especially for youth of color and youth with low incomes (Spaulding et al. 2015; Spievack et al. 2020). Research has documented the importance of approaches that are rooted in positive youth development, that provide intensive and holistic services and that incorporate meaningful opportunities for learning that are supported by adults (Lerner et al. 2005).¹ Effective employment programs provide opportunities to build skills connected to careers, offer opportunities for work-based learning, and support access to jobs (Fein and Hamadyk 2018; Ross et al. 2018). Although there is an emerging body of evidence about what works for youth, little is known about how to best deliver services remotely.

This practitioner resource guide—created to fill this important knowledge gap—identifies promising practices and tips for providing education and training, employment, and mental health services remotely to young people. Understanding best practices for remote service delivery is critical at this moment. The COVID-19 pandemic has forced programs, including those with no prior experience providing services remotely, to adapt to remote service delivery, providing a unique opportunity to study and draw lessons from a broad set of organizations and programs. Although the pandemic created an emergency in which programs were forced to rapidly take their services online with little time for planning, lessons can be drawn to inform future efforts to effectively serve youth.²

This guide identifies promising practices that emerged from interviews conducted in fall 2020 with staff members at 21 community-based nonprofits, national nonprofit intermediaries, universities and colleges, public agencies, and education and training institutions about the lessons they have learned from delivering services to youth remotely. To identify and select practitioners for interviews, we fielded a brief survey to youth-serving organizations and collected 43 responses from program staff to select a range of programs based on their confidence in remote service delivery, innovative strategies implemented, and population served. See the appendix for the full list of individuals interviewed and organizations represented in our data collection.

For each of the following strategies that emerged from the interviews, we provide information from the literature on effective service delivery, identify key issues and challenges, and elevate promising practices and tips:

- 1. Create the foundation for success—meet basic needs first
- 2. Strengthen organizational and staff capacity to meet new demands
- 3. Provide services that support mental and emotional health
- 4. Build community
- 5. Ensure instruction is engaging
- 6. Adapt experiential and work-based learning to the virtual environment

In our discussion of each of the strategies in the sections of the guide that follow, we also explore equity considerations for youth of color and youth who live in low-income families.

BOX 1

Key Terms

In this resource guide, we use the terms **remote** and **virtual** interchangeably to describe services delivered by phone, online, or through other digital means. In practice, some organizations may use a "hybrid" or "blended" approach, which combines fully online and face-to-face meetings to deliver services, instruction and supports to youth.^a

Given the service population of the organizations we interviewed, the term **youth** is used as shorthand throughout this guide to refer to youth and young adults ages 16 to 24. We focus on this age range because it is an important period of transition between youth and young adulthood for gaining additional skills that can impact economic mobility. However, we expect that the challenges, promising practices, and implications described throughout are also relevant to practitioners working with younger people and older adults.

^a For more information about hybrid and blended learning, see "Blended & Hybrid Learning," UNC Charlotte Center for Teaching and Learning, accessed January 29, 2021, https://teaching.uncc.edu/teaching-guides/blended-hybrid-learning.

Prioritizing Equity in Remote Service Delivery

When designing remote services, youth-serving organizations must consider where opportunity gaps exist and how to ensure all youth have the ability to benefit. The COVID-19 pandemic has amplified vast socioeconomic and racial disparities that are not rooted in the failings of individuals or their

families, but in societal and economic structures, including structural racism (Kijakazi et al. 2019) and the policies that produce income inequality and limit upward mobility.³ These structural barriers make it more difficult to access and meaningfully engage in remote learning. Specifically, while the COVID-19 pandemic has affected youth across racial, ethnic, and socioeconomic lines, youth of color and youth from families with low incomes are more likely than their peers to face economic hardship because of job loss or reductions in work hours, loss of loved ones, and increased incidences of mental health challenges (Karpman, Gonzalez, and Kenney 2020).⁴ The heightened visibility of police killings of black people has added a layer of trauma on top of the emotional turmoil already created by the pandemic (Campbell and Valera 2020).

Despite the acute needs brought on during the pandemic, these issues are not new. Black, Latinx, and Indigenous youth and youth from families with low incomes are more likely to face barriers to success in remote learning that are the result of generations of discriminatory policies and practices.⁵ These policies and practices have limited economic opportunity and access to high-quality education programs, digital devices and broadband internet, and job opportunities for youth as they work to achieve their goals and realize economic stability and security. Research has also extensively documented associations between racism and poor health outcomes (Williams and Mohammed 2009). All of these factors have made ensuring equity in remote service delivery both a greater challenge and a greater imperative.

Although remote programming can create challenges that widen existing disparities, it also offers the opportunity to expand access to important services for youth and young adults. Remote service delivery offers the potential to introduce different learning formats to youth who experience bullying or other emotional trauma, have work commitments, are resource constrained, are parents, or face other barriers in accessing in-person services. Services provided virtually may not be the best fit in every context, and organizations should consider the evidence and what works best for the youth they serve in determining whether to provide a service remotely or in person. In this guide, we lift up strategies for organizations to maximize the benefits of remote delivery and minimize challenges so that all youth, regardless of race, ethnicity, or socioeconomic status, have the ability to access and benefit from services delivered remotely.

Create the Foundation for Success

Young people cannot succeed in remote programming if they lack access to technology, if they do not have the digital skills to use technology effectively, if their home environments are not conducive to learning, and if their basic needs are not met (Blagg et al. 2020; Hecker and Briggs 2021). Individuals we interviewed shared that youth cannot be expected to effectively participate in remote service delivery before these prerequisites are met. Further, program staff observed that these barriers to remote learning are disproportionately experienced by youth of color and youth from families with low incomes.

Key Issues and Challenges

- No access to high-quality laptops and reliable internet. Program staff noted that many young people lack the necessary technology or internet connectivity to effectively participate in remote programming. Some youth share laptops with siblings or parents or can only use their phones to sign into lessons and complete assignments.
- Difficult home-learning environments. Nearly all program staff interviewed noted that many young people lack a designated space at home where they can focus on learning. Noise and other distractions in crowded households make learning challenging and made some students uncomfortable with turning their cameras on. These issues are exacerbated for youth who live in public housing, experience housing instability, or are incarcerated. Unlike issues with technology access that organizations can resolve with more money or resources, fostering a home-learning environment that is conducive to learning often requires policy solutions that are beyond the scope of an organization's day-to-day work.
- Competing priorities that distract from program participation. Young people juggle many competing demands and often must divide their time and energy between program participation, work, and familial responsibilities. If family members lose their jobs or see their work hours cut, youth sometimes have to work extra to make up for lost income. Program staff shared that many young people also must take care of family members or their own children.
- Resource constraints inhibit organizations' ability to meet increasing demand for basic needs.
 Interviewees described how the need for food, housing, and cash support often takes precedence over other components of programming such as instruction, counseling, and

- mentorship. Unmet needs, as well as the effort of gathering resources to meet basic needs, make it more difficult for students to focus on learning. Further, addressing mental and emotional health is as much of a prerequisite to success as addressing digital access and other basic needs (see the next section of this guide).
- Gaps in digital literacy and a learning curve with new technologies. Some organizations found that young people's existing technology skills prepared them relatively well for remote services. But despite common assumptions that youth are tech savvy, several program staff observed that many young people struggle to operate a computer and to use videoconferencing and other learning platforms.

"You can focus all you want on developing new flashy online programming, but if you haven't made sure every young person has the ability to connect and be present and has other needs taken care of, like taking care of siblings, then those things have to come first."

-Kevin Hickey, Jewish Vocational Service

Promising Practices and Tips

- Leverage funding and resources from grants and city or community-based initiatives to provide technology and Wi-Fi access to program participants. Nearly all program staff we spoke with mentioned that getting hardware into the hands of program participants was a priority and a critical lever for addressing equity gaps in access to remote programming. Several noted that they provided Chromebooks (low-cost laptops with a lightweight operating system) because they were the most cost-efficient option. Some programs noted that they benefited from local initiatives run by schools, cities, and technology companies that provided laptops and Wi-Fi hot spots to students. Programs also directly distributed equipment to participants through internal funding or grant funding. Several programs mentioned negotiating important flexibility with funders during the COVID-19 pandemic that allowed them to reallocate resources toward meeting young people's technology needs.
- Ensure access to spaces that are conducive to learning. Some organizations found creative
 ways to provide spaces for students to learn. For example, Goodwill Education Services

opened a Young Learners Center where participants, recent program graduates, and staff could work. Staff shared that it was important that these spaces allowed students to focus and provided a reliable internet connection. Program staff noted that absent an alternative physical space to complete work outside the home, it was helpful to provide supplies that created a designated space for learning at home, such as noise-canceling headphones, desks and chairs, and organization products.

- Use creative approaches to obtain resources and supports to address basic needs.

 Organizations described providing direct assistance to pay for participants' rent, utilities, food, and gas. A few organizations dropped off bus tokens, clothing, and gift cards at participants' homes. Program staff shared creative approaches to obtaining these resources. For example, a foundation partner that supports the Inner-City Computer Stars Foundation (i.c.stars) provided \$500 to any participant who needed it. Organizations also connected youth with emergency supports through local nonprofits and government assistance programs. For example, Café Reconcile helped over 150 young people apply for Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program benefits. Programs that were able to secure increased flexibility from funders during the pandemic also noted that this helped them meet young people's basic needs.
- Provide support for successful technology use. Organizations created trainings, instructional materials, guidelines, and troubleshooting mechanisms to help young people use new technologies. Urban Alliance and Goodwill Education Services noted ramping up their digital literacy trainings. District 1199c trained participants on how to use Google Drive and incorporated basic Chromebook troubleshooting into orientation. Recognizing the need for new norms in the digital classroom, several organizations created guidelines for video conference etiquette. And a couple organizations hired additional staff members to deal directly with technology issues. Our Piece of the Pie noted that their new technology associate has become "one of the most important people in the last year." Towards Employment started a "tech buddy" program, where volunteers from the community provide individualized assistance to help young people acclimate to new technologies. Multiple organizations described plans to build basic digital skills into their programming in the future and expressed optimism that funders were increasingly interested in supporting efforts to close racial equity gaps in digital literacy.
- Adjust expectations of staff to be mindful of young peoples' barriers to successful
 engagement. Several program staff stressed the need to use knowledge of young people's

barriers to participation to adjust expectations for participation in virtual settings. For example, it may be unfair to require young people to join a class using video if their internet bandwidth cannot support it or to count an absence against participants who need to take care of siblings in an emergency. Organizations mentioned that communicating these expectations to staff, as well as training and employer partners, was important. Further, Jewish Vocational Service staff noted that some employees adjusted their work hours to find convenient times to engage with young people amidst their other life circumstances.

"We at first thought [youth] were tech savvy because they're always on their phones, but [using the technology required for program participation is] not the same as scrolling through social media...There will be a shift in the job market because of COVID, and [youth] will need to be prepared to get employed remotely."

-Stephanie Stamp, Center for Alternative Sentencing and Employment Services (CASES)

BOX 2

Assessing Participants' Initial and Ongoing Needs

Many organizations emphasized that it was important to determine young people's needs for technology and other supports at the outset of remote learning so they could be quickly mitigated. Organizations also stressed the importance of intentionally monitoring and responding to participants' changing needs. Program staff shared creative strategies:

- Organizations created standardized needs assessments for young people's technology and basic needs. Our Piece of the Pie and Towards Employment implemented a technology assessment to understand youth's available resources (e.g., laptops and reliable Wi-Fi) and their familiarity with various technology platforms. Several organizations also conducted a virtual needs assessment at enrollment to identify challenges related to food security, money, and housing.
- Program staff met with participants one on one to troubleshoot technology challenges. At the Mental health Outreach for MotherS (MOMS) Partnership, pre-class engagement sessions have allowed staff members to get a sense of each participant's technology issues (such as with video conferencing and Wi-Fi) and to troubleshoot issues before classes began.
- Program staff noted the importance of continually assessing youth's needs through
 individualized outreach. Staff from Baltimore's Promise continually reach out to young people

to ascertain immediate and future needs so staff can respond and adjust services accordingly. Staff at Jewish Vocational Service said they are constantly asking themselves, "What's going on that can't be seen?" This helps them evaluate young people's needs at home and then consistently, intentionally, and assertively follow up with youth.

Strengthen Organizational and Staff Capacity to Meet New Demands

Capacity refers to the ability of organizations to fulfill their missions in an effective manner (De Vita and Fleming 2001). Organizations must build their capacity to adapt to changes in society and the service provision environment. The additional strain of the pandemic has already demonstrated that organizations are experiencing an increased demand for services. These unprecedented challenges have required youth-serving organizations to identify creative approaches to meet these new demands.

Key Issues and Challenges

- Staff burnout. Several organizations shared that their staff members endured enormous amounts of stress while providing remote services to youth. Although some of this burnout was directly related to the ongoing pandemic, effectively transitioning to virtual programming was an additional burden.
- Working with overburdened and ill-equipped partners. Program staff we spoke with shared that collaborating with partners who are unprepared for virtual programming is a major challenge. Staff described how certain workforce boards, schools and community colleges, banks, and departments of motor vehicles were overburdened and ill equipped for the transition to remote service delivery.
- Information overload about the transition to virtual services. Other individuals interviewed described how the plethora of trainings, campaigns, workshops, and guides on virtual programming available online make it difficult to discern which are actually useful, high quality, or relevant to specific organizations. Moreover, there is no central repository or open

- source by topic of the supports available. Some program staff described spending too much time searching through these resources only to find that they were poor quality or ineffective.
- Under-resourced organizational infrastructures. Organizations that are understaffed or lack sufficient funds often suffer capacity-related challenges. Organizations may need new staff or staff with different skill sets to meet the demands of remote service delivery and ensure the critical work of the organization gets done. Program staff shared they may also need additional grants to provide students and staff members with the proper technologies for remote services.

Promising Practices and Tips

- Program staff shared that remote service delivery may require additional resources or may require resources to be expended in different ways than they would be for in-person services. For example, when youth aren't meeting with staff in person, fewer resources are needed for transportation support, but more resources may need to be allocated to laptops and technology needs. Funders might consider the expectations and allocation of funds to meet virtual service needs. Interviewees also shared that special attention should be paid to maximize assets in place rather than duplicating existing efforts (e.g., organizations should take advantage of existing opportunities for youth to get subsidized technology, free Wi-Fi, and existing and open access technology tools).
- Train and support staff to effectively teach and provide services virtually. When moving services to remote delivery, organizations may need to redistribute work, pivot responsibilities, and rearrange training. For example, organizations such as Philadelphia Youth Network and Urban Alliance set up digital literacy and technology trainings to ensure their staff are well equipped to support themselves and ultimately their students. At Youth Guidance, instructors practice facilitating meetings virtually by running "demo sessions" for their fellow staff members. Because this provides an opportunity to fix mistakes and receive feedback, staff reported an increase in confidence and excitement about engaging with youth after these practice sessions.
- Exchange ideas and strategies through internal and external networks. Organizations can
 compile resources on virtual programming and share engagement strategies to learn from
 their collective expertise. For example, Youth Guidance uses an internal website to exchange

relevant videos, online games, instructional guides for remote activities, and brainstorming documents. They also run biweekly 30-minute brainstorming sessions on video conference for staff to pitch different ideas and strategies for virtual programming; these sessions are recorded and saved to the internal website. Organizations can also seek guidance from fellow youth-serving organizations directly or through networks and provider associations.

- Digitize and virtualize administrative processes as much as possible. To facilitate the transition to remote service delivery, organizations shifted recruitment, enrollment, and onboarding paperwork to online processes. Small changes have included using electronic signatures and converting paperwork to PDFs; more significant changes have involved moving toward mobile-friendly websites. Virtual staff meetings and trainings can allow greater, more frequent communication among colleagues.
- Create supports for staff well-being. Organizations noted that identifying resources for staff members' mental and emotional health was key to ensuring they could adequately serve youth. As a result, programs established both large-scale and granular-level supports for staff members. Some of the key accommodations have been in the form of developing mindfulness courses, offering ergonomics assessments and equipment for remote work, and designating certain days of the week as "breathing days" to encourage their staff to rest. Several program staff shared that it is important to provide staff enough space and time to properly take care of themselves, especially because schedules may be more packed when services are virtual because of less travel or transition time, smaller and more frequent group meetings, and perceived increased staff availability.

"We are trying to make sure our staff have balance. In a virtual setting, lines can be very blurred—you're feeling like you're constantly online or on calls and never taking a break. We are trying to do check-ins ... making sure staff are mentally and emotionally okay ... [and making] sure they're pouring into themselves what they're pouring into young people."

-Tyran Omary, Urban Alliance

Provide Services That Support Mental and Emotional Health

This section explores how youth-serving organizations are supporting youth's mental and emotional well-being by leveraging technology to deliver mental health services. The demand for these services has been on the rise during the pandemic as youths' plans for the future and social networks have been disrupted and many young people—especially youth of color—have faced financial, health and other acute challenges (Czeisler et al. 2020). Key considerations for providing mental and emotional case management to youth in a remote environment include identifying appropriate technology and considering privacy concerns and information sharing between health systems (Waters et al. 2020). Telemental health (the provision of mental health services remotely) may help address mental or emotional health challenges youth experience, reduce perceived stigma associated with mental health services, and increase access for youth who are not well served by traditional models of care (American Telemedical Association 2017).

Key Issues and Challenges

- High level of need for mental health services. Mental and emotional health challenges have always been a pressing concern for youth service providers. For example, after conducting a recent needs assessment, Goodwill found mental health was the biggest problem facing youth, with one-third of Goodwill's young people demonstrating signs of depression. Several service providers indicated that the pandemic has created a lot of anxiety for youth about the future, worsening isolation and depression rates. Staff also shared that families in poverty were disproportionately affected by stress because of the impact of pandemic shutdowns on low-wage earners who cannot work from home. Black youth have also been disproportionately impacted by the emotional trauma related to police brutality which received heightened visibility throughout 2020.
- Youth may experience difficulty opening up about personal challenges in a virtual setting.

 One organization reported that mental health supports were the most difficult of all services to bring online. Challenges were particularly pronounced when serving youth with mental health crises who did not have an existing relationship with program staff and may not be comfortable sharing personal health information in a virtual format.

Maintaining confidentiality and privacy. When providing mental health services, technology applications must comply with federal health care privacy laws (the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996, or HIPAA). One staff member reflecting on their approach to navigating HIPAA shared, "There is a protocol [for] where we can put specific information... There are things we didn't have to think about before, but now that technology is [everywhere], there are new compliance issues we have to keep in mind that affect us."

Promising Practices and Tips

- Offer different modes of communication to provide safe outlets for youth to seek support. Finding a private place at home can be challenging for young people engaging with remote mental health services, especially if youth have conflict in their homes or they don't feel comfortable being overheard by the adults they live with. One staff member we spoke with described how she prepares students to reach out by text or phone through a secure technology app if the student experiences a power outage, internet connection issue, or unsafe home environment. Programs should also consider which mental and emotional health supports should be provided in person and when in-person care is necessary.
- Partner with or hire mental health professionals to provide virtual group and one-on-one interventions. For example, Towards Employment provided trainings for staff on trauma-informed care and made referrals to partner organizations to provide additional mental health supports for youth. Goodwill brought on an art therapist who could work with students and staff one on one and in group settings, both virtually and in person. The organization also contracted with a behavioral health clinic to bring on a full-time counselor (splitting the cost of the counselor's salary). This counselor is available for both students and staff and leads professional development and trainings.
- To support emotional needs, prioritize mentoring activities. As staff at MENTOR, a national mentoring nonprofit, described, "Connection is key—to both the technology, and to an actual, present adult. Kids just need and want to be connected, so whatever we can do to let them know they still have the support systems, is [best]." E-mentorship programs and consistent connection points with youth can help provide continuity so that caring connections with adults can persist even remotely. MENTOR staff also shared how an additional spotlight on racial injustices in 2020 led to an uptick among youth-serving organizations expressing interest for mentoring services from organizations who did not previously offer mentorship supports to youth.

• Determine appropriate technology for protecting privacy. Baltimore's Promise has been using the Spruce app to protect youth privacy. They ask youth to complete a general form where they can indicate interest in different topics related to mental health and request individual follow-up from a staff counselor. They found about 65 to 70 percent of those who completed the form requested individual follow-ups. Before the first individual meeting, youth download the Spruce app, answer questions to set up a secure account, and review a consent form, enabling them to send and receive texts, review documents, and participate in video calls for counseling sessions through the platform. This allows for secure, HIPAA-compliant texting, calling, and video calling. The app can also automate texts that provide emergency information and resources for texts and phone calls received outside of work hours.

"[Youth] are already dealing with losses related to violence in the city – that's often what people are asking for help with. Others have known they've felt anxious or depressed for years, but seeking mental health support seemed very complicated or was never been normalized before... Mental health support has become a lot more accessible for young people."—Jessica Mott, Baltimore's Promise

Build Community

Building a sense of community involves creating a safe, inclusive space where norms and values are communicated and where young people want to be. Research has documented the importance of caring adults in the lives of young people (Walker and White 1998), so the community that is created virtually must also present opportunities for similar engagement with caring adults. A positive community for young people will create opportunities for positive peer-to-peer engagement as well as opportunities for youth to share their voice and exert power and influence (Evans 2007). Community should also foster a sense of belonging, and youth should feel embraced for their authentic, diverse, and intersectional identities (Education Design Lab 2021). In contrast, a lack of community may leave youth feeling unsupported or alienated and can damage young people's motivation and achievement (Goodenow 1993).

Key Issues and Challenges

- Forming connections through video platforms. Program staff noted the obstacles to developing genuine relationships through video conferencing platforms. Facilitating natural, casual conversations that allow young people to establish mutual trust is a difficult task for staff. For example, when most participants on a call have their cameras and microphones off, a young person sharing a personal story or making a joke may feel uncomfortable or awkward about their peers' lack of reaction. This might discourage them from participating again in the future.
- Establishing relationships with youth new to a program. It is challenging to start a relationship virtually and much easier to continue an already-established relationship through technology. Program staff believe this stems from feelings of unfamiliarity and detachment as well as from discomfort opening up about personal experiences with people they do not know well.
- Missing physical spaces for youth to convene and connect. At one organization we spoke with, the Alaska Native Science and Engineering Program (ANSEP), young people had become accustomed to building community through activities, such as sharing meals in the kitchen. Because ANSEP serves Alaska Natives, a community that has been geographically and socially segregated from predominantly white higher-education institutions for generations, not being able to facilitate the peer support necessary to help youth succeed is particularly damaging for youth of color. Project MALES—Mentoring to Achieve Latino Educational Success—also typically establishes connections through in-person meetings and over food. Not having the physical spaces affiliated with community—and the opportunity to "break bread" together—has been hard on both students and staff.

Promising Practices and Tips

Develop thoughtful onboarding for new students. To bridge the gap for new students, organizations said it was necessary to go above and beyond by creating meaningful orientations and a carefully crafted, positive initial experience. For example, staff at the MOMS Partnership developed a new pre-program session to become acquainted with participants on a deeper level and increase students' investment in class. Engagement with and attendance in the program has already improved as a result of these sessions, because new participants understand how the course may be beneficial for them, are more familiar with the organization and its goals, and feel that staff are invested in them.

- Create opportunities for increased connection with new audiences. Remote service delivery allowed several organizations to widen their community, bringing in students and organizational partners across geographic barriers. For Project MALES, this has allowed the organization to engage with youth participants from out of state and bring on national-level training partners. At CareerWise Colorado, this enabled program staff to connect their youth of color with program alumni and cultivate resources for an equity initiative.
- Make the virtual space fun. Organizations had different strategies to continue community-building events and celebrations remotely. For example, i.c.stars ran a talent show for staff and students online, led virtual games, and had an event where youth could vote on who should get a pizza delivered to them. Project MALES hosted a virtual retreat and mailed care packages. Staff at Our Piece of the Pie posted virtual content highlighting their personal interests. They also explored platforms and apps to play group games among youth, staff, and organizational partners.
- Engage in intentional and active communication with participants. Staff need to be proactive in communicating and building relationships with participants. This may involve individual phone conversations and check-ins with youth participants beyond regular programming. Individuals we interviewed shared that these consistent one-on-one relationships maintain and strengthen the sense of community for youth.
- Organize team-building activities and group work. Several programs we spoke with created subgroups within their larger cohorts so students could get to know each other on a deeper level, because building connections with one person or a small group can be easier than with more people. The approach to team building and fostering a sense of community could be revisited over time to keep virtual interactions lively and engaging.
- Consider a mix of in-person and virtual activities. Although fully remote services were required during the pandemic because of health risks, going forward, programs can consider which activities to hold in person and which to hold online or in a hybrid format. For example, given the challenges we heard about from staff regarding how the remote environment can make it difficult to build new relationships, it may make sense to facilitate initial introductions to programs, informal events, and other community-building activities in person.

Ensure That Instruction Is Engaging

Program staff also shared with us their experiences and challenges with providing engaging instruction remotely. Prior research demonstrates that engaging instruction is crucial for students' learning, participation, and academic achievement (Bransford, Brown, and Cocking 2000; Rockoff 2004), and virtual instruction requires a particularly nuanced and innovative approach to be effective (Fernandes et al. 2014). Engaging virtual instruction produces positive instructor-student relationships, a greater sense of student satisfaction, and better student performance (Martin 2019). To deeply engage through an online environment, staff must select strategies that work for their particular contexts. Building a more equitable approach to remote service delivery requires systems of learning to engage populations that they were never designed for, such as youth of color (specifically Black, Indigenous, or Latinx youth), youth who are immigrants or children of immigrants, and youth who live in poverty.

Key Issues and Challenges

- Exhaustion and lack of concentration. Nearly every organization described young people experiencing difficulty with focusing in remote classes. "Zoom fatigue" was referenced as a common obstacle, especially for young people who already spend hours of their day on other video conferencing platforms. For this reason, getting young people to show up for meetings and calls can be challenging. A staff member from Youth Guidance remarked, "Before, we were able to distinguish ourselves—now it just feels like more class for the young people. That takes a big hit on their motivation."
- Catering to individualized learning styles and unique learning needs. Just as young people have diverse backgrounds, their learning styles and preferences are also varied. Although some young people perform well in a virtual setting, others find the lack of progress check-ins and the rigidity of many online classes to be off-putting. Meeting the needs of nonnative English speakers and youth with higher emotional and accommodation needs can be particularly difficult in the remote environment. And even when targeted programming exists for youths' more specialized needs, it can be difficult for providers to gauge the quality of the engagement. One staff member reflected, "If you're in person, people are outside their [regular] environment and in a shared environment. You can engage people in a variety of ways. A lot of our young people really know themselves well and say, 'I'm a visual learner!' or 'I learn by doing!' But when it's through the computer or phone, you might be using different techniques [that] require your engagement in this one [specific] way."

Time and technology management. We heard from program staff that youth have difficulty carving time out in their schedules to complete trainings, because not all young people are taught or have had experience in managing self-paced work, teaching themselves, or asking for help outside of class time. Working parents without flexible schedules cannot always be home to help young people connect with online education or activities. Further, instructors have found that preparing classes takes much longer than it did in-person. Jewish Vocational Service staff explained that this is because everything in a remote setting requires "designing, testing, and implementing" beforehand. Although both youth and instructors are learning how to adapt to new technologies, instructors who are not up to speed on those technologies are particularly unable to offer the level of support and communication students need.

Promising Practices and Tips

- Shorten, stagger, and reduce the size of classes. Some organizations observed young people were more willing to engage in small groups and thus decreased their instructor-to-student ratio to facilitate more focused communication. Students' capacity, energy, and attention levels should also be considered. Some program staff we spoke with saw the benefit of creating short, more frequent engagements scheduled over several weeks rather than longer engagements squeezed into a few days. Because engagement can have a major impact on people's economic mobility for the rest of their lives and shape regional economic growth, finding ways to increase engagement is particularly important for historically marginalized communities and individuals (Education Design Lab 2021).
- Design interactive and intentional curriculum. Creating activities that are relevant, engaging, and fun is already a challenge with in-person engagement, but it is particularly crucial with virtual service delivery. Some organizations such as ANSEP try to celebrate success by providing rewards and incentives; others, such as CASES, use breakout rooms on video platforms to ensure all students' voices can be heard. Leveraging technology, organizations such as LRNG at Southern New Hampshire University began implementing automated quizzes that affiliated partners could customize so that youth could receive pop-up messages and immediate feedback as they progressed through content. Youth Guidance discussed incorporating music as much as possible while remaining deliberate about the best ways to do so effectively rather than cause a distraction. Program staff also described how curricula should also be centered on the population served; for example, the engagement needs of 16-year-olds may differ from the engagement needs of 24-year-olds. Likewise, revisiting and revising strategies over time is crucial.

- Consider a variety of teaching models. Organizations used a combination of online platforms and hybrid models, ¹⁰ asynchronous and synchronous work, ¹¹ and physical and digital materials to deliver instruction. Each method has advantages and disadvantages, and organizations prioritized developing models that would best fit the populations they served. We heard overwhelmingly that using technology to facilitate learning, whether fully online or using a hybrid approach, produced new opportunities and benefits. For example, putting certain trainings online can make them self-directed and less of a burden for students and instructors. Several organizations saw a measurable uptick in engagement and participation in online services.
- Strengthen communication to keep students on track. In addition to increasing communication to build community, interviewees expressed that increased individualized communication in different formats supports student learning. The Door and ANSEP organized one-on-one appointments for students over video conference and phone, while LRNG at Southern New Hampshire University staffed an academic advisor to support students feeling stuck or lost. Philadelphia Youth Network noted that checking in with a young person two or three times a week about a task increases the likelihood that it will be completed, and the MOMS Partnership had community health ambassadors text and call participants between sessions to encourage homework completion and class attendance. Along with strengthening communication with youth, MENTOR highlighted the importance of intentionally and frequently checking in with caregivers, especially those who may be in tougher situations (e.g., single parents or parents with long work hours).
- Embed flexibility and balance into programming. Organizations agreed successful remote programming is both flexible and regular. Examples of flexibility include allowing students to engage with programming in multiple ways (e.g., not always being on video), accepting that not all curriculum content could translate to videoconference platforms, and adapting incentives to a virtual environment (e.g., changing the number of required attendance hours or altering proof of milestone completions). Shifting away from rigid outcomes is also a way to improve equitable service delivery in the remote environment. At the same time, continuing the reinforcement of norms in a virtual environment is helpful as well. Service providers can strike a balance between holding students accountable and being understanding and patient.
- Involve youth in decisionmaking processes. Organizations have used surveys and conversations to solicit feedback from young people. ANSEP asked which technology tools youth most preferred in designing virtual programming, Project MALES conducted focus

groups to learn what services sounded beneficial and how young people wanted to see those services delivered, and Northwest Education Access surveyed students on what additional supports they needed for online learning. Letting students take ownership of their success can drive greater engagement with the overall material and content. Incorporating student voices can also uplift the experiences of Black youth and others who may feel disempowered or excluded by traditional systems.

BOX 3

Scaffolding the Levels and Styles of Engaged Instruction

Organizations highlighted different methods to facilitate more engaging instruction.

- Youth Guidance emphasizes "breaking things down and building up to the bigger questions" in online classes. Their instructors steer away from posing large, open-ended questions to the students up front. Instead, they begin by sharing a more specific question, asking students to respond briefly in the chat, and then calling on someone to elaborate on the answer they have already put forward. Their staff found that tactics allowing young people to engage in easier, simpler ways can increase the overall likelihood that students will contribute.
- CareerWise Colorado explored ways technology can track young people's engagement in the learning process. Program staff noted this was especially beneficial when trying to understand what is working and where students are getting stuck. For the asynchronous components of instruction, staff created a learning journey on Salesforce with module-style pieces of content. As students progressed in the program, staff could observe higher levels of engagement, follow-through, and completion.
- In addition to posting materials online, the MOMS Partnership mailed physical copies of the course manual to participants' homes. They knew that navigating multiple screens and windows could take away from the dynamic and experience of the class, and staff wanted to make their virtual space feel as similar to a real-life classroom as possible.

"Showing up for students is important – saying 'I hear you' and validating them, but letting them know, 'It's okay if this quarter may not work out for you and let's look ahead.' A lot of [our youth] have gone through generational trauma, so being there for them is so important."—Hansell Torres, Northwest Education Access

Adapt Experiential and Work-Based Learning to the Virtual Environment

Many organizations we spoke with focus on preparing youth and young adults for successful careers and employment opportunities. Work-based learning experiences can include job shadowing, career readiness activities, internships, apprenticeship, and other forms of paid work (such as summer youth employment programs). These opportunities are important to expose youth to the workplace, facilitate professional connections, provide formal or informal occupational skills training, and help youth understand the requirements of a future career (Briggs, Spievack, and Blount 2019). Youth programs moving services online or offering a hybrid format—part in person, part online— have to be creative about offering virtual and simulated experiential, or "hands-on" learning, experiences to teach career-readiness skills in new ways that allow youth to learn by doing (Martin and Swigert 2020). 13

Key Issues and Challenges

- Virtualizing employment requires different types of supports. Identifying and adapting employment experiences to the virtual or hybrid context can be extremely difficult. In some occupations that require physical manipulation of tools and expensive hardware, it may not be possible to fully shift work online. Where it is possible to move work to a virtual format, participation in online work experiences leads to new logistical questions about digital access, including who is responsible for providing the technology—the young person themselves, their school, the youth-serving organization, or the work placement? Program staff indicated these challenges could be difficult for staff and employers who may also be navigating new expectations and norms for virtual work. Regardless, there is an equity imperative in identifying alternatives when in-person options aren't possible. During the pandemic, from summer to fall 2020, Black male and female youth and Asian female youth maintained higher rates of unemployment compared with their peers over the same period (Inanc 2020).
- Hands-on learning can be difficult to simulate in a virtual environment. Program staff described how jobs that require hands-on, tactile learning (such as occupations in the culinary arts or health care) are difficult to recreate in a simulated experience online and led to challenges identifying internships in these sectors. Staff members shared that this presented an acute challenge during the COVID-19 pandemic because stay-at-home orders and reduced consumer spending have hit retail and hospitality industries especially hard. Jobs in the retail

- and hospitality industry employ nearly half of all youth workers and, with limited exceptions, cannot be done at home. 14
- Monitoring the safety, supervision, and support of young people in a virtual environment. The virtual context may require new systems to monitor interactions or check in with youth about their employment experiences. Virtual workplaces do not have other adults in close proximity to observe inappropriate behavior. We heard from staff that youth may miss out on informal interactions with other coworkers and professionals that are easier to facilitate with an in-person workplace. These informal interactions are important for professional connections and to help youth feel supported in their career development.

"Postsecondary readiness and workforce development is all about transitioning to going to work—how do you virtualize that? We had to reimagine virtual spaces that at least gave [youth] the opportunity to build their workforce skills virtually."

—Hector Rivera, Our Piece of the Pie

Promising Practices and Tips

- Explore opportunities to pay youth for job development activities and virtual work-based learning. Some programs that provide youth with job development training and connections to employment opportunities tie wages to participation in milestone-based experiences and activities online. For example, Philadelphia Youth Network operated a hybrid participant payment system, including incentive-based payments and wages. The compensation was determined based on the type of program being operated. In times when employment opportunities are sparse, this approach can allow for more flexibility to pay youth for their time spent in career-readiness programs.
- **Connect youth with work experiences aligned with in-demand occupations that can be done remotely.** Jobs in fields centered around the use of technology may already have virtual
 internship options available. Certain occupations in information technology, marketing, and
 advertising are particularly well suited to the virtual context. Jewish Vocational Service San
 Francisco staff described how employers who already had existing technology capacity,

- especially those interested in the youth perspective for their social media accounts and advertising campaigns, were more willing to hire virtual interns.
- Provide support for employers to transition to virtual work experiences. YouthForce NOLA, Philadelphia Youth Network, and Urban Alliance all described holding trainings for employers or being in the process of developing resources for employers on how to create work environments that are conducive to youth working remotely. This involved developing playbook guides and toolkits for employers and job supervisors on how to run a virtual internship, understand the circumstances of youth, and set up a virtual work environment that supports and respects young people's needs.
- Create additional opportunities for career exposure through virtual technology. Employers can engage with youth through technology, such as virtual job fairs and information panels. This allows youth to connect with professionals all over the country at low or no cost to the program. This increased access to career professionals, mentors, and information about available career options can be a strategy for promoting equity for youth of color and youth with low incomes, and it may be particularly beneficial for rural youth or youth who are located in areas with limited employment opportunities. Providing this virtual proximity to employers and other mentors can provide new outlets for youth to network and build relationships that help youth see themselves in professional roles and build confidence.

Implications for Organizations, Funders, and Policymakers

In this resource guide, we have described creative strategies used by a set of youth-serving organizations to ensure their remote services are accessible to and effective for the populations they serve. We spoke with them in the midst of a global pandemic, when emergency circumstances have created unprecedented challenges for young people, youth of color, and the organizations that serve them. But rather than uncovering new challenges, the circumstances of the pandemic elevated youth's existing needs and highlighted broad systemic issues that are at the root of racial and wealth inequality. Their experience of remote service delivery during the pandemic also surfaced promising practices and offers lessons on virtual service delivery for youth-serving organizations, funders, and policymakers to realize goals of equity, expanded access, and improved outcomes for youth.

Youth-serving organizations should

- center their approach to online and virtual programming around what is known about effective delivery of services to youth that meets young people's developmental and basic needs;
- use an equity-centered approach that considers the specific histories, challenges, and strengths of the various populations being served;
- create opportunities for young people to help shape programming to ensure that programs are designed with their needs in mind;
- support staff in the transition to remote service delivery by providing opportunities for professional development, peer learning, and access to resources on best practices;
- consider a hybrid approach to maximize the benefits of virtual and in-person services; and
- continue efforts to develop the digital skills of young people to help youth maintain resiliency in the labor market.

Funders should

- provide resources to support research, partnerships, and programming to help make the case for additional public investment in services and supports for this population;
- allow for flexible funding that enables programs to account for front-end technology and infrastructure costs, including providing youth with long-term access to technology, and adapt to urgent needs in times of rapid economic change;
- make staff development and training—including training in online modalities and service delivery—an allowable expense, if not a priority, in grantmaking;
- support the development of tools, resources, and opportunities for peer learning and professional development across youth-serving organizations and networks; and
- fund digital skills training across grantees, in conjunction with other funded programming, given the importance of technology skills for successfully accessing key public services.

Policymakers at all levels of government should

 increase workforce and other funding outside the public education system to support young people's needs for support and assistance;

- take steps to expand broadband internet and computer access to make it more accessible and affordable, including consideration of a public option for the internet, and coordinating across funding streams to maximize available resources;
- invest in the public education system and public programs to develop young people's digital skills throughout their life course, enabling youth to more readily access education, training, employment, and other services;
- provide mental and emotional health supports to promote youth well-being and enhance engagement in, and impact of, new and existing public programming or education systems; and
- consider how to enhance and improve the user experience when accessing public services
 through digital tools as a strategy for meeting the basic needs of young people and vulnerable
 communities, making critical services and supports more accessible.

The rapid pace of technological change accelerated by the pandemic will only further the need to continue building knowledge about what it takes to effectively provide remote services to youth. Continued attention to and investment in the needs of youth—especially youth of color—will help ensure that they thrive in a digital world.

Appendix A: Interviewees

Rodrigo Aguayo, Program Coordinator, Project MALES

Sadiq Ali, Executive Director, Maryland MENTOR

Lili Allen, Associate Vice President, JFF

Shelley Ashley, Senior Director, Mission Advancement

Jay Bayhurst, Senior Manager, Young Adult Services and Special Projects, Towards Employment

Clare Bertrand, Director - JFF Labs, JFF

Paige Boetefuer, Director of Internships, YouthForce NOLA

Elizabeth Cheung, Senior Program Officer, Opportunity Youth Initiative, Conrad N. Hilton Foundation

Patrice Cromwell, Vice President, Center for Economic Opportunity, The Annie E. Casey Foundation

Farrah Farnese, Senior Director of External Relations, Philadelphia Youth Network

Stephanie Gambone, Executive Vice President, Philadelphia Youth Network

Amanda Gerrie, Cofounder and Partner, Pathway Consultants

Rico Gonzalez, Administrative Program Coordinator, Project MALES

Jade Grieve, Senior Advisor, America Achieves

Kevin Hickey, Director of High School and Bridge Programs, Jewish Vocational Service

Liz Hoagland, Managing Director, Bronx Youth Center

Maya Kandell, Counselor, Jewish Vocational Service

Sandee Kastrul, President and Cofounder, i.c.stars

Kathy Litchfield, Chief Program Officer, Café Reconcile

Renee Marongwe, Ecosystem Director of Strategy and Analysis, Southern New Hampshire University

Sarah Mercado, @Work Manager, Youth Guidance

Monique Miles, Vice President, Aspen Forum for Community Solutions & Managing Director, Opportunity Youth Incentive Fund, The Aspen Institute

Jessica Mott, LCSW-C, Grads2Careers Counselor, Baltimore's Promise

Tyran Omary, Senior Director of Programs, Urban Alliance

Hector Rivera, Chief Operating Officer, Our Piece of the Pie

Hollis Salway, Director of Development and Research, CareerWise Colorado

Herbert Schroeder, Vice Provost and Founder, Alaska Native Science & Engineering Program

Dan Scott, Director of Corporate Impact and Analytics, Goodwill Education Initiatives

Gregg Seaton, Associate Director, JFF

Stephanie Stamp, Director of Education and Career Services, CASES

Dudney Sylla, Program Director, MENTOR National

Hansell Torres, Education Advocate, Northwest Education Access

Isabel Torres, Special Assistant, Elevate Policy Lab at Yale

Roland Williams, Lead Coordinator, GED to Health Careers Program, District 1199C Training and Upgrading Fund

APPENDIX 25

Appendix B: Characteristics of Organizations Interviewed

Organization name	Focal population	Mission statement	Types of youth services provided
Alaska Native Science and Engineering Program (ANSEP)	Alaska Native students	Effect systemic change in the hiring patterns of Alaska Natives in science and engineering by placing students on a career path to leadership	College preparation, career exploration
Baltimore's Promise Grads2Careers Initiative	Recent Baltimore City Public Schools graduates	Establish a pathway for recent Baltimore City Public Schools graduates into career-track jobs in growing industries, on the path to a family-supporting wage	Occupational skills trainings, counseling services
Café Reconcile	Young adults	Transform the lives of young adults and the community through the ministry of reconciliation	Hospitality job training and life skills
Center for Alternative Sentencing and Employment Services (CASES)	Youth at risk of or with previous criminal justice system involvement	Increase public safety through innovative services that reduce crime and incarceration, improve behavioral health, promote recovery and rehabilitation, and create opportunities for success in the community	Behavioral health, clinical and community alternatives, education and employment, counseling and wellness, pretrial
CareerWise Colorado	High school students	Create opportunities for youth and businesses across Colorado by developing and supporting an innovative, sustainable youth apprenticeship program	Pathway-specific training, preworkplace skills
District 1199c Training and Upgrading Fund, GED to Career Program	Philadelphia youth	Provide access to career pathways in health care and human services for incumbent workers and job seekers through education, training, and work-based learning; build the capacity of the Delaware Valley's health care industry to create a highly skilled workforce through on-the-job training opportunities and the development of an education pipeline that aligns with career-ladder steps	Occupational training, GED classes and testing, tutoring and counseling
Goodwill Education Initiatives, Inc.	Traditional and alternative high school students and youth with additional challenges (e.g., foster and juvenile system involvement, teen moms)	Help individuals and families become economically self-sufficient	Tuition-free, charter high school; job readiness and training; Nurse- Family Partnership

<mark>26</mark> APPENDIX

i.c.stars	Low-income young adults	Activate a technology community of change agents to power social and economic freedom	Technology-based workforce development, leadership training, and career development
Jewish Vocational Service: San Francisco Bay Area (JVS)	San Francisco youth	Help young people experience the world of work and transition to postsecondary education or a job with career potential	Employment, work- based learning, transition pathways
Mental Health Outreach for Mothers (MOMS) Partnership	Overburdened, underresourced mothers over age 18 (not exclusively youth)	Reduce depressive symptoms and increase social and economic mobility among overburdened, underresourced mothers, thereby strengthening generations of families to flourish and succeed	Mental health treatments, family economic success and job-readiness supports
MENTOR	Youth	Fuel the quality and quantity of mentoring relationships for America's young people and close the mentoring gap for the one in three young people growing up without this critical support	Mentoring
Northwest Education Access	Low-income young people	Provide comprehensive and individualized support to help low-income young people build their own path to higher education and beyond	Navigation, mentorship, higher- education planning
Our Piece of the Pie	Urban youth	Empower youth with the key competencies needed to overcome barriers and succeed in education and employment	Case management, educational and job readiness programs
Philadelphia Youth Network	Philadelphia's young people	Create coordinated systems which promote the attainment of academic achievement, economic opportunity and personal success	Workforce preparation, youth employment
Project MALES	Latino male students	Enhance Latino male student success at all levels of the educational spectrum	Peer mentoring program for students
Southern New Hampshire University	College students	Expand access to education by creating high-quality, affordable, innovative pathways to meet the unique needs of each and every learner.	Higher education
The Door	Young people in New York City	Empower young people to reach their potential by providing comprehensive youth development services in a diverse and caring environment	Reproductive healthcare and education, mental health counseling, legal assistance, college preparation, job training and placement

APPENDIX 27

Towards Employment	Jobseekers	Empower individuals to achieve and maintain self-sufficiency through employment	Job readiness, career planning, coaching, work experience and technical training
Urban Alliance	Under-resourced high school students, primarily youth of color	Empower under-resourced youth to aspire, work, and succeed through paid internships, job skills training, and mentoring	Job skills training, mentoring, paid internships
YouthForce NOLA	New Orleans public school students	Prepare New Orleans public school students for successful pursuit of high-wage, high-demand career pathways and facilitate systems change to ensure equitable outcomes	Work experience, technical skills training, soft skills training
Youth Guidance	Youth	Create and implement school-based programs that enable children to overcome obstacles, focus on their education and, ultimately, to succeed in school and life	Counseling and prevention, community and afterschool, workforce development

Source: Authors' analysis of programs.

28 APPENDIX

Notes

- ¹ For more resources on positive youth development and other research on youth program effectiveness, see https://youth.gov/youth-topics/positive-youth-development.
- ² The COVID-19 crisis has offered an unprecedented case study of remote learning. The most consequential of these circumstances include that (1) the transition to remote service delivery was rapid and mandatory, which led to a lack of preparedness among organizations, youth participants, and employer partners; (2) any in-person instruction and interaction was precluded (at least for some time); (3) youth were isolated from social interaction; and (4) youth and program staff were dealing with unprecedented emotional and financial burden and family obligations. These circumstances may limit the applicability of some of the findings in this resource guide to remote service delivery once the pandemic ends. However, we believe that much of what we present here will remain relevant and provides important lessons for successful remote service provision moving forward.
- ³ Elise Gould, "Inequality Is the Main Cause of Persistent Poverty," *Working Economics* (Economic Policy Institute blog), January 8, 2014, https://www.epi.org/blog/inequality-main-persistent-poverty/.
- ⁴ See also "Risk for COVID-19 Infection, Hospitalization, and Death by Race/Ethnicity," Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, last updated March 12, 2021, https://www.cdc.gov/coronavirus/2019-ncov/covid-data/investigations-discovery/hospitalization-death-by-race-ethnicity.html; and Isabella Kwai and Elian Peltier, "What's the Point?' Young People's Despair Deepens as the Covid-19 Crisis Drags On," *New York Times*, February 14, 2021, https://www.nytimes.com/2021/02/14/world/europe/youth-mental-health-covid.html.
- ⁵ Natalie Spievack and Megan Gallagher, "For Students of Color, Remote Learning Poses Multiple Challenges," *Urban Wire*, June 23, 2020, https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/students-color-remote-learning-environments-pose-multiple-challenges
- ⁶ Amanda Briggs and Shayne Spaulding, "Three Ways Technology Can Help Nontraditional Students Succeed in Online Coursework," *Urban Wire*, September 20, 2018, https://www.urban.org/urban-wire/three-ways-technology-can-help-nontraditional-students-succeed-online-coursework.
- ⁷ Tim Delaney, "Warning Signs about the Fragility of Nonprofits in the Pandemic Era," National Council of Nonprofits, November 12, 2020, https://www.councilofnonprofits.org/thought-leadership/warning-signs-about-the-fragility-of-nonprofits-the-pandemic-era.
- ⁸ See https://www.sprucehealth.com.
- ⁹ Kristin Kipp and Kerry Rice, "How Can Educators Tap Into Research to Increase Engagement During Remote Learning?" EdSurge, May 6, 2020, https://www.edsurge.com/news/2020-05-06-how-can-educators-tap-into-research-to-increase-engagement-during-remote-learning.
- Prior research has shown that student learning outcomes among "mixed-method" courses that use both face-to-face and online instructional methods (such as hybrid and blended models) have the strongest evidence for improving student learning outcomes when content is delivered over technology. See Margulieux, McCracken, and Catrambone (2016).
- Synchronous instruction requires students to join lectures or class activities virtually at the same time as their instructor, as if they were attending an in-person class. This limits student flexibility but may allow students to more actively engage with course content and one another. Asynchronous instruction has lower barriers to

NOTES 29

- entry because students have the flexibility to engage with course content on their own schedule, but students may be less supported in their learning without additional opportunities to connect.
- "Workforce Innovation Technical Assistance Center," accessed February 26, 2021, http://www.wintac.org/topic-areas/pre-employment-transition-services/overview/work-based-learning-experiences.
- ¹³ "WIOA Youth Program COVID-19 Session Lessons Learned," WorkforceGPS, accessed March 29, 2021, https://youth.workforcegps.org/resources/2020/06/15/18/59/WIOA-Youth-Program-COVID-19-Session-Lessons-Shared.
- ¹⁴ Nicole Goldin, "If History Repeats: Coronavirus' Economic Danger to Youth," Atlantic Council, March 13, 2020, https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/new-atlanticist/if-history-repeats-coronavirus-economic-danger-to-youth/

NOTES NOTES

References

- American Telemedical Association. 2017. "Practice Guidelines for Telemental Health with Children and Adolescents." Telemedicine and e-Health. Volume: 23 Issue 10. Oct 2017.779-804.http://doi.org/10.1089/tmj.2017.0177
- Bernard, Robert M., Philip C. Abrami, Eugene Borokhovski, C. Anne Wade, Rana M. Tamim, Michael A. Surkes, and Edward Clement Bethel. 2009. "A Meta-Analysis of Three Types of Interaction Treatments in Distance Education." *Review of Educational Research* 79(3): 1243–89.
- Blagg, Kristin, Erica Blom, Megan Gallagher, and Macy Rainer. 2020. *Mapping Student Needs during COVID-19*. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Bransford, John D., Ann L. Brown, and Rodney R. Cocking, eds. 2000. How People Learn: Brain, Mind, Experience, and School. Washington, DC: National Academies Press.
- Briggs, Amanda, Natalie Spievack, and David Blount. October 2019. "Employer Engagement in Summer Youth Employment Programs." Washington, DC: Urban Institute. https://www.urban.org/research/publication/employer-engagement-summer-youth-employment-programs
- Campbell, Felicia, and Pamela Valera. 2020. "The Only Thing New is the Cameras': A Study of U.S. College Students' Perceptions of Police Violence on Social Media." *Journal of Black Studies* 51 (7): 654–70.
- Czeisler, Mark E., Rashon I. Lane, Emiko Petroski, Joshua F. Wiley, Aleta Christensen, Rashid Njai, Matthew D. Weaver, Rebecca Robbins, Elise R. Facer-Childs, Laura K. Barger, Charles A. Czeisler, Mark E. Howard, and Shantha M.W. Rajaratnam. 2020. "Mental Health, Substance Abuse, and Suicidal Ideation During the COVID-19 Pandemic." Morbidity and Mortality Weekly Report 69(32): 1049-1057. https://www.cdc.gov/mmwr/volumes/69/wr/mm6932a1.htm
- De Vita, Carol J., and Cory Fleming. 2001. Building Capacity in Nonprofit Organizations. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Education Design Lab. 2021. "Walk in My Shoes: An Actionable Learner Engagement Framework to Foster Growth, Belonging, and Agency." Washington, DC: Education Design Lab.
- Evans, Scot D. 2007. "Youth Sense of Community: Voice and Power in Community Contexts." Journal of Community Psychology 35 (6)): 693–709.
- Fein, David, and Jill Hamadyk. 2018. Bridging the Opportunity Divide for Low-Income Youth: Implementation and Early Impacts of the Year Up Program. Washington, DC: US Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families, Office of Planning, Research, and Evaluation.
- Goodenow, Carol. 1993. "Classroom Belonging among Early Adolescent Students: Relationships to Motivation and Achievement." *The Journal of Early Adolescence* 13, no. 1: 21–43.
- Hecker, Ian, and Amanda Briggs. 2021. Overlooked and Underconnected: Exploring Disparities in Digital Skills Levels by Race among Older Youth in the US. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Inanc, Hande. 2020. "Breaking Down the Numbers: What Does COVID-19 Mean for Youth Unemployment?" Cambridge, MA: Mathematica. https://www.mathematica.org/our-publications-and-findings/publications/breaking-down-the-numbers-what-does-covid-19-mean-for-youth-unemployment
- Karpman, Michael, Dulce Gonzalez, and Genevieve M. Kenney. 2020. Parents are Struggling to Provide for Their Families during the Pandemic: Material Hardships Greatest among Low-Income, Black, and Hispanic Parents. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Lerner, Richard M., Jacqueline V. Lerner, Jason B. Almerigi, Christina Theokas, Erin Phelps, Steinunn Gestsdottir, Sophie Naudeau, Helena Jelicic, Amy Alberts, Lang Ma, Lisa M. Smith, Deborah L. Bobek, David Richman-

REFERENCES 31

- Raphael, Isla Simpson, Elise DiDenti Christiansen, and Alexander von Eye. 2005. "Positive Youth Development, Participation in Community Youth Development Programs, and Community Contributions of Fifth-Grade Adolescents: Findings From the First Wave Of the 4-H Study of Positive Youth Development." *Journal of Early Adolescence* 25 (1): 17–71.
- Margulieux, Lauren E., Michael McCracken, and Richard Catrambone. 2016. "A Taxonomy to Define Courses That Mix Face-to-Face and Online Learning." *Educational Research Review* 19: 104–18.
- Martin, Jeffrey. 2019. "Building Relationships and Increasing Engagement in the Virtual Classroom: Practical Tools for the Online Instructor." Journal of Educators Online 16 (1): n1.
- Martin, Nancy and Mike Swigert. June 2020. "1.0 Digital Summer Youth Employment Toolkit." Washington, DC: Aspen Institute. https://aspencommunitysolutions.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/SYEP-Digital-Toolkit.pdf
- Martz, Jill, Claudia Mincemoyer, and Niki Nestor McNeely. 2016. Essential elements of 4-H youth development programs: Curriculum and training guide. Washington, DC: National 4-H Council.
- Rockoff, Jonah, E. 2004. "The Impact of Individual Teachers on Student Achievement: Evidence from Panel Data." American Economic Review 94 (2): 247–52.
- Fernandes, Sandra, Diana Mesquita, Maria Assunção Flores, and Rui M. Lima. 2014. "Engaging Students in Learning: Findings from a Study of Project-Led Education." European Journal of Engineering Education 39: 1, 55–67.
- Ross, Martha, Kristin Anderson Moore, Kelly Murphy, Nicole Bateman, Alex DeMand, and Vanessa Sacks. 2018. Pathways to High-Quality Jobs for Young Adults. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution. https://www.brookings.edu/research/pathways-to-high-quality-jobs-for-young-adults/
- Smith, Walter Howard Jr. 2010. The Impact of Racial Trauma on African Americans. Pittsburgh: The Heinz Endowments.
- Spaulding, Shayne, Robert I. Lerman, Harry J. Holzer, and Lauren Eyster. 2015. Expanding Economic Opportunity for Young Men and Boys of Color through Education and Training. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Spievack, Natalie, Madeline Brown, Christin Durham, and Shayne Spaulding. 2020. Exploring Approaches to Increase Economic Opportunity for Young Men of Color: A 10-Year Review. Washington, DC: Urban Institute.
- Walker, Joyce, and Lonnie White. 1998. "Caring Adults Support the Healthy Development of Youth." Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Digital Conservancy.
- Waters, Annette, Pamela Winston, and Robin Ghertner. 2020. "Virtual Case Management Considerations and Resources for Human Services Programs." Washington, DC: Office of the Assistant Secretary for Planning and Evaluation, US Department of Health and Human Services.
- Williams, David R., and Selina A Mohammed. 2009. Discrimination and racial disparities in health: evidence and needed research. J Behav Med. 2009 Feb;32(1):20-47. doi: 10.1007/s10865-008-9185-0. Epub 2008 Nov 22. PMID: 19030981; PMCID: PMC2821669. https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/19030981/

REFERENCES REFERENCES

About the Authors

Amanda Briggs is a senior research associate in the Income and Benefits Policy Center at the Urban Institute. Her research focuses on online learning, workforce development policy analysis and program evaluation, and employer involvement in education and training. Briggs is deputy director for the Career and Technical Education (CTE) CoLab Coalition and College Community of Practice program, led by Urban. Briggs earned a master's in public affairs with a concentration in social and economic policy from the Lyndon B. Johnson School of Public Affairs at the University of Texas at Austin.

Shayne Spaulding is a senior fellow in the Income and Benefits Policy Center, where her work focuses on the evaluation of workforce development and postsecondary education programs. Spaulding directs the Career and Technical Education (CTE) CoLab Coalition and College Community of Practice program. She has spent more than 20 years in the workforce development field as an evaluator, technical assistance provider, and program manager. Her research has examined the public workforce system; community college innovations; employer engagement in workforce programs; services to parents, youth, and noncustodial fathers; and other topics.

Natalie Spievack is a research analyst in the Income and Benefits Policy Center. Her work focuses on issues in education and workforce development, with an emphasis on racial equity. Her research has included quantitative and qualitative studies of early childhood education systems, postsecondary education and training programs, youth employment, and programs that are aimed at meeting the needs of low-income individuals and young mothers. Spievack graduated with honors from the University of Wisconsin–Madison, where she earned a BA in political science and economics.

Ayesha Islam is a research assistant in the Income and Benefits Policy Center. Her work focuses on workforce development issues, and her research has included qualitative studies of racial equity leadership initiatives, apprenticeships for transitioning veterans, and remote service delivery for youth. She previously served as a New York City Urban Fellow for the NYC Department of Small Business Services, where she supported the creation of programs to reduce racial disparities in economic opportunity. Islam graduated with a BA in political science from Bryn Mawr College.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS 33

Theresa Anderson is a senior research associate at the Urban Institute. She is a member of the Building America's Workforce cross-center initiative and is affiliated with the Income and Benefits Policy Center and the Education Data and Policy Center. She conducts in-depth, mixed-methods research on important policy issues, primarily evaluations of workforce, education, and social safety net programs and policies. Anderson has a PhD and MPP in public policy and public administration from George Washington University. She also received a BA from Hampshire College in Massachusetts.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

STATEMENT OF INDEPENDENCE

The Urban Institute strives to meet the highest standards of integrity and quality in its research and analyses and in the evidence-based policy recommendations offered by its researchers and experts. We believe that operating consistent with the values of independence, rigor, and transparency is essential to maintaining those standards. As an organization, the Urban Institute does not take positions on issues, but it does empower and support its experts in sharing their own evidence-based views and policy recommendations that have been shaped by scholarship. Funders do not determine our research findings or the insights and recommendations of our experts. Urban scholars and experts are expected to be objective and follow the evidence wherever it may lead.



500 L'Enfant Plaza SW Washington, DC 20024

www.urban.org